

1 PILLSBURY WINTHROP SHAW PITTMAN LLP  
 BRUCE A. ERICSON #76342  
 2 DAVID L. ANDERSON #149604  
 JACOB R. SORENSEN #209134  
 3 MARC H. AXELBAUM #209855  
 BRIAN J. WONG #226940  
 4 50 Fremont Street  
 Post Office Box 7880  
 5 San Francisco, CA 94120-7880  
 Telephone: (415) 983-1000  
 6 Facsimile: (415) 983-1200  
 Email: bruce.ericson@pillsburylaw.com

7  
 8 SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP  
 DAVID W. CARPENTER (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
 BRADFORD A. BERENSON (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
 9 DAVID L. LAWSON (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
 EDWARD R. McNICHOLAS (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
 10 1501 K Street, N.W.  
 Washington, D.C. 20005  
 11 Telephone: (202) 736-8010  
 Facsimile: (202) 736-8711

12 Attorneys for Defendants  
 13 AT&T CORP. and AT&T INC.

14 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 15 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 16 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

17  
 18 TASH HEPTING, GREGORY HICKS,  
 CAROLYN JEWEL and ERIK KNUTZEN  
 19 on Behalf of Themselves and All Others  
 Similarly Situated,

20 Plaintiffs,

21 vs.

22 AT&T CORP., AT&T INC. and DOES 1-20,  
 23 inclusive,

24 Defendants.

No. C-06-0672-VRW

**RESPONSE OF DEFENDANT AT&T  
 CORP. TO ORDER REGARDING  
 RECUSAL (DKT. 59)**

Courtroom: 6, 17th Floor  
 Judge: Hon. Vaughn R. Walker

1 On April 14, 2006, the Court issued an Order (Dkt. 59) regarding its review of this  
2 matter for possible recusal. In the Order, the Court invites the parties to submit briefs  
3 addressing the matters in the Order. Order at 6:1-6. Defendant **AT&T CORP.** (“AT&T”)  
4 submits this response.

5 AT&T agrees with the Court’s analysis and does not believe that Judge Walker’s  
6 status as a former subscriber to telephone services offered by AT&T or its affiliates or  
7 predecessors constitutes a conflict of interest that would require recusal under 28 U.S.C.  
8 § 455 or any other applicable law.

9 Dated: April 21, 2006.

10 PILLSBURY WINTHROP SHAW PITTMAN LLP  
11 BRUCE A. ERICSON  
12 DAVID L. ANDERSON  
13 JACOB R. SORENSSEN  
14 MARC H. AXELBAUM  
15 BRIAN J. WONG  
16 50 Fremont Street  
17 Post Office Box 7880  
18 San Francisco, CA 94120-7880

15 SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP  
16 DAVID W. CARPENTER  
17 BRADFORD A. BERENSON  
18 DAVID L. LAWSON  
19 EDWARD R. McNICHOLAS  
20 1501 K Street, N.W.  
21 Washington, D.C. 20005

19 By \_\_\_\_\_ /s/ Bruce A. Ericson  
20 Bruce A. Ericson

21 Attorneys for Defendants  
22 AT&T CORP. and AT&T INC.  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28