

1 PETER D. KEISLER
 Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division
 2 CARL J. NICHOLS
 Deputy Assistant Attorney General
 3 DOUGLAS N. LETTER
 Terrorism Litigation Counsel
 4 JOSEPH H. HUNT
 Director, Federal Programs Branch
 5 ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO
 Special Litigation Counsel
 6 ANDREW H. TANNENBAUM
 ALEXANDER K. HAAS (SBN 220932)
 7 Trial Attorneys
 Email: tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov
 8 U.S. Department of Justice
 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
 9 20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Rm. 6102
 Washington, D.C. 20001
 10 Phone: (202) 514-4782
 Fax: (202) 616-8460

11 *Attorneys for Federal Defendants Sued in their Official Capacities*
 12 *and the Federal Intervenor-Defendants (United States of America,*
 13 *National Security Agency, President George W. Bush)*

14 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 15 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
 16 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

17 IN RE NATIONAL SECURITY) **No. M:06-cv-01791-VRW**
 AGENCY TELECOMMUNICATIONS)
 18 RECORDS LITIGATION)

19 This Document Relates To:) **STIPULATION PERMITTING THE UNITED**
) **STATES TO INTERVENE; AND [PROPOSED]**
) **ORDER**

20 (1) All Actions Against the MCI and)
 Verizon Defendants in the Master MCI) Judge: Hon. Vaughn R. Walker
 21 and Verizon Consolidated Complaint,)
 Dkt. 125; (2) *Chulsky* (MDL 06-06570)) Date: June 21, 2007

22 except:)
)

23 (3) *Bready* (MDL 06-06313))
 24)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

RECITALS

A. On January 16, 2007, pursuant to this Court’s case management order, the plaintiffs in suits against the Verizon and MCI defendants filed a Master Complaint [Dkt. 125]. In addition, there are several other cases against Verizon defendants not covered by the Master Complaint, such as *Riordan* (MDL 06-3574); *Bready* (MDL 06-06313); and *Chulsky* (MDL 06-06570).

B. This Court entered an Order [Dkt. 217] giving the United States until April 20, 2007, to file a “motion to dismiss or, in the alternative, for summary judgment and any assertion of the state secrets privilege” in the MCI and Verizon cases.

C. The United States intends to assert the state secrets privilege in each of these cases, and seeks intervention in order to seek the dismissal of these cases.

D. The United States requested the stipulation of all plaintiffs in the MCI and Verizon cases where the United States had not yet intervened,¹ as well as the stipulation of MCI’s counsel and Verizon’s counsel. With the exception of the *Bready* and *Riordan* plaintiffs, all MCI and Verizon parties have stipulated to the intervention of the United States. The United States’ intervention in *Bready* is dealt with in a separate motion filed concurrently herewith.

STIPULATION

The MCI and Verizon Plaintiffs, with the exception of those in *Bready* and *Riordan*, counsel for MCI defendants and counsel for Verizon defendants, and the United States, through their attorneys of record, hereby stipulate and request that the Court make this stipulation an order of the Court:

1. The United States shall be permitted to intervene in the above-referenced actions as a Defendant pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 24.

¹ The United States moved to intervene in the *Riordan* case in August 2006, and that motion to intervene was granted on March 29, 2007, see *Riordan*, 05-cv-3574, Dkt. 64 (Mar. 29, 2007).

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Ronald L. Motley
Jodi W. Flowers
Don Migliori
Vincent Parrett (State Bar No. 237563)
MOTLEY RICE, LLC
28 Bridgeside Boulevard
P.O. Box 1792
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465
Telephone: (843) 216-9000
Facsimile: (843) 216-9027

By: /s/ Jodi W. Flowers

Jodi W. Flowers
Interim Class Counsel for Verizon Class

SHAPIRO & STERNLIEB, LLC
DAVID H. STERNLIEB
800 Tennent Rd.
Manalapan, NJ 07726
(732) 617-8050

By: /s/ David H. Sternlieb

David H. Sternlieb
Attorney for Chulsky Plaintiffs

WILMER, CUTLER, PICKERING, HALE & DORR LLP
JOHN A. ROGOVIN
RANDOLPH D. MOSS
SAMIR C. JAIN
BRIAN BOYNTON
BENJAMIN C. MIZER
1875 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
Washington, DC 20006
202-663-6083
Fax: 202-663-6363

By: /s/ John Rogovin

John Rogovin
Attorneys for the MCI Defendants and Verizon Defendants

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Elizabeth J. Cabraser (State Bar No. 083151)
Barry R. Himmelstein (State Bar No. 157736)
Michael W. Sobol (State Bar No. 194857)
Eric B. Fastiff (State Bar No. 182260)
Allison S. Elgart (State Bar No. 241901)
LIEFF, CABRASER, HEIMANN & BERNSTEIN, LLP
275 Battery Street, 30th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111-3339
Telephone: (415) 956-1000
Facsimile: (415) 956-1008

By: /s/ Barry R. Himmelstein per G.O. 45

Barry R. Himmelstein
Interim Class Counsel for MCI Class

Ronald L. Motley
Jodi W. Flowers
Don Migliori
Vincent Parrett (State Bar No. 237563)
MOTLEY RICE, LLC
28 Bridgeside Boulevard
P.O. Box 1792
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465
Telephone: (843) 216-9000
Facsimile: (843) 216-9027

By: /s/ Jodi W. Flowers per G.O. 45

Jodi W. Flowers
Interim Class Counsel for Verizon Class

SHAPIRO & STERNLIEB, LLC
DAVID H. STERNLIEB
800 Tennent Rd.
Manalapan, NJ 07726
(732) 617-8050

By: /s/ David H. Sternlieb per G.O. 45

David H. Sternlieb
Attorney for Chulsky Plaintiffs

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

WILMER, CUTLER, PICKERING, HALE & DORR LLP
JOHN A. ROGOVIN
RANDOLPH D. MOSS
SAMIR C. JAIN
BRIAN BOYNTON
BENJAMIN C. MIZER
1875 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
Washington, DC 20006
202-663-6083
Fax: 202-663-6363

By: /s/ John Rogovin per G.O. 45

John Rogovin
Attorneys for the MCI Defendants and Verizon Defendants

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER

Having considered the above stipulation to permit intervention by the United States pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 24, the United States is allowed to intervene in the actions covered by the stipulation as a defendant.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: April ²⁴ __, 2007

