



Benesch has been ranked in the First-Tier nationally in Transportation Law in the 2015 Edition of U.S. News & World Report/ Best Lawyers "Best Law Firms" ranking.

The U.S. News & World Report/Best Lawyers[®] "Best Law Firms" rankings are based on an evaluation process that includes the collection of client and lawyer evaluations, peer review from leading attorneys in their field and review of additional information provided by law firms as part of the formal submission process. For more information on Best Lawyers, please visit www.bestlawyers.com.



FLASH NO. 46 COURT DEALS CRUSHING BLOW TO MASSACHUSETTS INDEPENDENT CONTRACTOR LAW

Practical Bursts of Information Regarding Critical Independent Contractor Relationships

On February 5, 2015, Judge Robert G. Stearns issued industry-favorable decisions in two worker classification suits pending in the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts. Based upon the First Circuit Court of Appeals' ruling in *Massachusetts Delivery Ass'n v. Coakley*, 769 F.3d 11 (1st Cir. 2014) ("MDA"), Judge Stearns withdrew a previous order and granted summary judgment in favor of FedEx Ground in *Schwann, et al. v. Fedex Ground Package System, Inc.*, and dismissed plaintiffs' complaint against J.B. Hunt in *Remington, et al. v. J.B. Hunt Transport, Inc.* In both decisions, Judge Stearns instructed the Clerk of Courts to close the cases.

In *MDA*, the First Circuit reversed a decision that the Massachusetts Independent Contractor Law, Mass. Gen. Laws ch. 149, §148B (the "Massachusetts "ABC" Test") was not preempted for motor carriers under the Federal Aviation and Administration Authorization Act of 1994 ("FAAAA"). The Massachusetts "ABC" Test provides that a worker is properly classified as an independent contractor if the employer can show that: (1) the individual is free from control and direction in connection with the performance of the service, both under his contract for the performance of service and in fact; and (2) the service is performed outside the usual course of the business of the employer, and (3) the individual is customarily engaged in an independently established trade, occupation, profession or business of the same nature as that involved in the service performed. Since the Massachusetts "ABC" Test could affect a motor carrier's prices, routes, or services, and concerns a motor carrier's transportation of property, the Court returned the case to the District Court to determine whether the statute satisfied the broad FAAAA preemption based upon the record of the case.

Guided by *MDA*, in *FedEx Ground* Judge Stearns considered whether the second prong of the "ABC" Test had a logical or even indirect effect on the delivery of services or the setting of rates. He concluded that the application of the "ABC" Test would "unquestionably have an impact on 'price, route[s], [and] services' by in effect proscribing the carrier's preferred business model." As a result, FAAAA preempted the second prong of the "ABC" Test.

Further, since the statute was enacted in the conjunctive (meaning each prong had to be satisfied to classify a worker as an independent contractor), the preempted second prong could not be severed from the statute as whole. Thus, Judge Stearns determined that the entire statute must be treated as preempted under FAAAA. In any event, Judge Stearns reasoned that enforcing either prong one or prong three of the "ABC" Test would lead to the same result, a preempted impact on a motor carrier's choice of business model.

The District Court's application of the *MDA* decision is very positive. We will continue to monitor these cases, as the *FedEx Ground* plaintiffs have already appealed Judge Stearns' decision the First Circuit Court of Appeals. In the meantime, should you have any questions regarding these developments or how they may impact your independent contractor operations, we would be very happy to help.

For more information

Contact **J. Allen Jones, III** at ajones@ beneshlaw.com or (614) 223-9323

Mr. Jones is a partner with the firm's Litigation Practice Group as well as with the Transportation & Logistics Group. He focuses his practice on transportation and logistics, commercial and contract disputes, real estate disputes and foreclosures, replevins, the long-term care industry, and construction litigation. Mr. Jones has represented clients in disputes before numerous state and federal courts, the American Arbitration Association, the Ohio Civil Rights Commission, and in alternative dispute resolution. Although Mr. Jones primarily focuses his practice on commercial litigation matters, he has significant experience in bankruptcy and bankruptcy litigation matters, including creditor representation, and prosecuting and defending preference litigation.

Additional Information

For additional information, please contact:

Transportation & Logistics Practice Group

Michael J. Barrie at (302) 442-7068 or mbarrie@beneschlaw.com Marc S. Blubaugh at (614) 223-9382 or mblubaugh@beneschlaw.com Tamar Gontovnik at (216) 363-4658 or tgontovnik@beneschlaw.com Matthew D. Gurbach at (216) 363-4413 or mgurbach@beneschlaw.com James M. Hill at (216) 363-4444 or jhill@beneschlaw.com Jennifer R. Hoover at (302) 442-7006 or jhoover@beneschlaw.com J. Allen Jones III at (614) 223-9323 or ajones@beneschlaw.com Thomas B. Kern at (614) 223-9369 or tkern@beneschlaw.com Peter N. Kirsanow at (216) 363-4481 or pkirsanow@beneschlaw.com David M. Krueger at (216) 363-4683 or dkrueger@beneschlaw.com Christopher J. Lalak at (216) 363-4557 or clalak@beneschlaw.com Tamara L. Maynard at (614) 223-9378 or tmaynard@beneschlaw.com Andi M. Metzel at (317) 685-6159 or ametzel@beneschlaw.com Kelly E. Mulrane at (614) 223-9318 or kmulrane@beneschlaw.com Lianzhong Pan at (86 21) 3222-0388 or lpan@beneschlaw.com Martha J. Payne at (541) 764-2859 or mpayne@beneschlaw.com Stephanie S. Penninger at (317) 685-6188 or spenninger@beneschlaw.com Richard A. Plewacki at (216) 363-4159 or rplewacki@beneschlaw.com Peter K. Shelton at (216) 363-4169 or pshelton@beneschlaw.com Clare R. Taft at (216) 363-4435 or ctaft@beneschlaw.com Katie Tesner at (614) 223-9359 or ktesner@beneschlaw.com Eric L. Zalud at (216) 363-4178 or ezalud@beneschlaw.com

Labor & Employment Practice Group

Maynard Buck at (216) 363-4694 or mbuck@beneschlaw.com Joseph Gross at (216) 363-4163 or jgross@beneschlaw.com Rick Hepp at (216) 363-4657 or rhepp@beneschlaw.com Christopher J. Lalak at (216) 363-4557 or clalak@beneschlaw.com Peter Kirsanow at (216) 363-4481 or pkirsanow@beneschlaw.com Katie Tesner at (614) 223-9359 or ktesner@beneschlaw.com

www.beneschlaw.com

As a reminder, this Advisory is being sent to draw your attention to issues and is not to replace legal counseling.

UNITED STATES TREASURY DEPARTMENT CIRCULAR 230 DISCLOSURE: TO ENSURE COMPLIANCE WITH REQUIREMENTS IMPOSED BY THE IRS, WE INFORM YOU THAT, UNLESS EXPRESSLY STATED OTHERWISE, ANY U.S. FEDERAL TAX ADVICE CONTAINED IN THIS COMMUNICATION (INCLUDING ANY ATTACHMENTS) IS NOT INTENDED OR WRITTEN TO BE USED, AND CANNOT BE USED, FOR THE PURPOSE OF (i) AVOIDING PENALTIES UNDER THE INTERNAL REVENUE CODE, OR (ii) PROMOTING, MARKETING OR RECOMMENDING TO ANOTHER PARTY ANY TRANSACTION OR MATTER ADDRESSED HEREIN.